Manual for monitoring food marketing to children
This publication has been sponsored by the Nuffield Foundation.
The Nuffield Foundation is an endowed charitable trust that aims to improve social well-being in the widest sense. It funds research and innovation in education and social policy, and also works to build capacity in education, science and social science research. The Nuffield Foundation has funded this project, but the views expressed are those of the authors, and not necessarily those of the Foundation. More information is available at www.nuffieldfoundation.org.

About Consumers International (CI)
Consumers International (CI) is the only independent global campaigning voice for consumers. With over 220 member organisations in 115 countries, we are building a powerful international consumer movement to help protect and empower consumers everywhere. For more information, visit www.consumersinternational.org.

Consumers International is a not-for-profit company limited by guarantee in the UK (company number 4337865) and a registered charity (1122155).

Manual for monitoring food marketing to children
ISBN No: 978-0-9567403-6-6
Published by Consumers International in September 2011

Consumers International
24 Highbury Crescent
London N5 1RX, UK
consint@consint.org
www.consumersinternational.org
Twitter: @Consumers_Int

Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 License
creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0
Credits

This report was written by May Shelton at CI with the assistance of Justin Macmullan, Anna Glazer and Rosy Voudouri at CI. Key reviewers of the report included Sue Davies at Which? (UK), Prof Gerard B Hastings at Stirling and the Open University, Dr Corinna Hawkes, Dr Tim Lobstein at IASO-IOTF, Ellen Sokol and Prof Boyd Swinburn at WHO Collaborating Centre for Obesity Prevention and Related Research and Deakin University.

Design and typesetting: Andrea Carter

Photo credits

Front cover: Main image, Little Spanish girl, www.sxc.hu


Page 6: Grayson, our granddaughter, eating a Georgia peach, by Bruce Tuten licensed under CC-BY-NC, available from www.flickr.com/photos/savannahgrandfather/312427606

Page 7: Billboards: Childhood obesity vs McD, by Lauren Craig available from: http://chathamchatlist.com


Group of five happy children jumping outdoors, by Lightruth licensed under CC-BY-NC, available from www.flickr.com/photos/58648496@N02/5380522396


Burger King Crown, by Andrew Malone licensed under CC-BY-NC, available from www.flickr.com/photos/andrewmalone/5354730996


Page 29: Websites: M&M Facebook page, M&M downloads page, McDonalds

Page 31: Websites: Cap’n Crunch, Kellogg’s


### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BMI</td>
<td>Body mass index</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CI</td>
<td>Consumers International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FSA</td>
<td>Food Standards Agency (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTC</td>
<td>Federal Trade Commission (US)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOTF</td>
<td>International Obesity Taskforce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCDs</td>
<td>Non-communicable diseases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP model</td>
<td>Nutrient profiling model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>Non-governmental organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA</td>
<td>World Health Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>World Health Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

PART 1
Introduction 6
  Background 6
What is this manual for? 8
The aims and objectives of the manual 9
Structure of the manual 9
Step-by-step research guide 11
  1. Resources and deciding the scope of monitoring research 11
  2. Deciding which communications channels to monitor 14
  3. Set the key definitions 15
  4. Sample specification 18
  5. Data collection and data coding 19
  6. Data analysis 22
  7. Reporting the results 24

PART 2
Specific considerations for monitoring the marketing of food and non-alcoholic beverages to children 27
  Television 27
  Print media 28
  Food companies’ websites 29
  Outdoor advertising 32
  Food packaging 33
  In-school marketing 34

APPENDICES
  Appendix A Australian food-categorisation system 36
  Appendix B The UK FSA traffic light system 37
  Appendix C Commercial activities in schools 38
  Appendix D Key reading 39

REFERENCES 42

LIST OF TABLES
  Table 1 Illustrative example of monitoring levels 12
  Table 2 Examples of key data 14
  Table 3 How to define unhealthy foods 16
  Table 4 Illustrated example of sample specification 18
  Table 5 Coding form key information 20
  Table 6 Coding form core variables and codes 20
  Table 7 Suggested basic analysis 22
  Table 8 Sample selection using data on children’s internet use 30
  Table 9 Sample selection using advertising expenditure data 30

LIST OF BOXES
  Box 1 Key Figures on childhood obesity 7
  Box 2 Facts and figures on global marketing spend and trends 7
  Box 3 Defining the terms 10
Non-communicable diseases (NCDs) such as cardiovascular disease, diabetes and some cancers are major causes of death and illness around the world with an estimated 35 million deaths each year occurring due to NCDs. One of the four main risk factors for NCDs is an unhealthy diet. Although poor diets can contribute to NCDs without leading to obesity, overweight and obesity are among the most visible signs of this crisis. The dramatic rise in obesity in children and youth worldwide means children are at an increased risk of obesity and related chronic diseases in adulthood. (See key figures on childhood obesity in Box 1).

Tackling the crisis in childhood obesity requires a number of actions to improve children’s diets and promote exercise. Greater attention must be given to which foods and beverages children are encouraged to consume, and Consumers International believes action to limit the marketing of foods high in saturated fats, trans-fatty acids, free sugars, or salt directly to children is fundamental to any long-term solution.

Several major reviews of the evidence on the impact of food marketing to children show a connection between food marketing and children’s food preferences, purchase requests and consumption patterns.\(^2\)\(^3\)\(^4\)

In May 2010, the 63rd World Health Assembly (WHA) agreed a “Set of recommendations on the marketing of foods and non-alcoholic beverages to children”\(^5\) (referred to as the WHO Recommendations hereafter). The WHO Recommendations urge member states to implement policies with the aim “to reduce the impact of marketing of foods high in saturated fats, trans-fatty acids, free sugars, or salt to children” by addressing the dimensions of ‘exposure’ and ‘power’ of marketing of foods to children.

In many countries, the development of policy to meet the objectives set out by the WHO Recommendations is a new area, and governments will need to assess the current extent of exposure and influence of food and beverage marketing to children.

Research which monitors the exposure and the power of food marketing to children will be needed to inform the development of new policy, to monitor implementation of new or existing policy (either regulatory or voluntary), and to assess the need for increased restrictions on marketing. Monitoring can also be used to track the effects of a policy once implemented and policy compliance by all relevant parties.
Box 1: Key figures on childhood obesity

- The International Obesity Taskforce (IOTF) estimates that globally up to 200 million school-aged children are either overweight or obese, and, of those, 40-50 million are classified as obese.7
- Worldwide in 2010, it is estimated that 43 million children under the age of five were overweight and obese. Of those, 35 million lived in developing countries.
- The worldwide prevalence of overweight and obesity in pre-school children is expected to rise from 6.7% in 2010, and reach 9.1% or close to 60 million children under five in 2020.
- The estimated prevalence of childhood overweight and obesity in Africa in 2010 was 8.5%, and is expected to reach 12.7% in 2020.
- The prevalence is lower in Asia (4.9% in 2010) than in Africa (8.5% in 2010), but the number of affected children (18 million) is higher in Asia.

Box 2: Facts and figures on global marketing spend and trends

- Globally, measured media spending on food is the third largest category after automotive and personal care. USD11.9 billion was spent on food advertising in 2008.8
- In the US, in 2006, 44 of the largest food and beverage marketers spent USD1.6 billion marketing their products to children and adolescents. Of this, marketers spent USD745 million, or 46% of the 2006 total, on TV advertising.9
- According to a 2010 forecast, global advertising spend online will reach USD96.8 billion by 2014, up from USD55.2 billion in 2009. Online advertising spend will make up 17% of total global advertising spending.10
- Companies are directing more of their global advertising budgets towards emerging and developing countries; the share of global marketing spending increased in Asia and the Pacific, Latin America and the Middle East between 2007 and 2008.11
What is this manual for?

This manual is designed to support governments, local governments and civil society in monitoring the exposure and power of marketing of foods to children.

The way in which the manual is used will depend on the outputs required from the monitoring and on the organisational capacity for carrying it out. For instance, research to support policy development will require a more comprehensive approach than a small study designed to build up an evidence base as to the extent and nature of food marketing to children.

Regardless of the scope of the planned research, many of the decisions regarding the research design and the steps that need to be taken to collect and analyse the data are similar. This manual provides information and guidance to help make those decisions.

The manual has been designed to be easily accessible to researchers without previous experience in monitoring research. Good research is a step-by-step process. With careful planning, common sense and the right research methods and tools, monitoring can be achieved by individuals or teams of researchers without years of training and experience.

Three levels of monitoring are set out with each researcher choosing the appropriate level of monitoring; core, expanded and desirable, based on the available resources.

There is not a one-size-fits-all model to monitoring food marketing which is applicable to the aims of every individual or organisation. Users of the manual are encouraged to refer to the relevant sections for their particular needs taking into account country-specific contextual factors.

Use existing studies as ‘case studies’ from which to learn and choose ideas. A list of key readings and references to monitoring studies by professional and academic institutions and consumer groups can be found in Appendix D.

It is also recommended that the manual is read in conjunction with the WHO Set of Recommendations on the marketing of food and non alcoholic beverages to children.
The aims and objectives of the manual

Aim
To furnish researchers from diverse organisational and national contexts with the tools necessary to gather evidence on the marketing to children of food and non-alcoholic beverages high in saturated fats, trans-fatty acids, free sugars, or salt.

To provide guidance on:
• how to design and implement research to monitor food marketing to children via different marketing communications channels
• how to analyse the content of food marketing by assessing the different techniques employed by food marketers
• how to analyse and present results.

To aid researchers in answering the following questions for each communications channel being monitored:
• How much food marketing is directed at children?
• What food groups are typically advertised to children?
• What marketing techniques are being used to market food to children?
• What is the volume of marketing of healthy and less healthy food products to children?

Content analysis is used to collect and analyse food marketing throughout.

Structure of the manual
The manual is in two parts:
Part one presents a step-by-step guide to the theory and practice of monitoring research; from planning and design, data collection, data coding and analysis to the reporting of results.

In Part two, the focus is narrowed down to give examples of the detailed considerations needed to monitor specific marketing channels. The manual includes guidance for monitoring television, print publications, food company websites, outdoor advertising, product packaging and marketing in schools (this selection is not exhaustive but includes some of the most widely used marketing communications channels).
Defining the terms

As stated by the WHO, the effectiveness of marketing communications can be described as a function of “exposure and power”.

**Exposure** relates to the reach and frequency of the message:
- **Reach** is the percentage of people in a target market who are exposed to the message over a specified period.
- **Frequency** is a measure of how many times the average person is exposed to a message.

**Power** relates to the ability to influence the viewer using various techniques in the content, design and execution of the marketing communications message (see marketing techniques).

**Communications channel** refers to the media or setting through which marketing communications occurs (e.g., television, print, internet, schools, stores).

**Food** refers to food and non-alcoholic beverages.

**Integrated marketing** refers to the integration of a wide marketing mix that includes product, price, place and promotion. A campaign often uses a wide range of communications channels and marketing techniques to market food and beverages to children. For example, themes from television advertising may carry over to packaging, displays in stores or onto websites.

**Marketing communications** refers to any form of commercial communication or message that is designed to, or has the effect of, increasing the recognition, appeal and/or consumption of particular products and services. It comprises anything that acts to advertise or otherwise promote a product or service. This broad definition includes marketing communications via:
- television
- radio
- cinema
- internet
- text messaging and other new media
- product placement
- viral marketing
- information services
- magazines
- posters
- sponsorship (e.g., of schools, children's sports and music events)
- product packaging
- product design
- point of sale positioning.

**Marketing techniques** refers to the different marketing and creative techniques used, and includes for instance the use of sponsorship, cartoon characters, celebrities, competitions, product placements, interactive games and other techniques, which are designed to appeal to children.

**Measured media** refers to media that have formal measurement statistics in terms of the amount of advertising dollars that are spent (typically TV, radio, newspapers, online and outdoor).

**Nutrient profiling** is used to classify a specific food as healthy or less healthy, and may be used in policymaking to determine whether a product should be subject to marketing restrictions to children. Different nutrient profiling models exist, which differentiate foods on the basis of their nutritional and composition index to reach an overall assessment of the food's 'healthiness', e.g., healthy or unhealthy.
Research can be laborious and expensive, and few organisations can afford the luxury of large-scale research programmes. Invariably, decisions regarding the scope of the project are limited by the constraints of time and cost. Therefore, when planning a monitoring programme, it is important to design the research based on a clear vision of how the results will be used and who the audience will be. Ultimately, the usefulness of research lies in its impact and its ability to deliver the facts and analysis needed to inform and influence policy development. This is possible with small and large research programmes.

Three levels of monitoring are set out, and the choice is based on what is needed and what resources are available. The levels are:

- **Core monitoring** is designed to answer the question: *Is there evidence of a problem?* Monitoring could comprise collecting a small sample of examples of marketing to children to start building up an evidence base. Use a food-group categorisation system to demonstrate the type of products typically marketed to children. In this instance, resources may not allow the systematic data coding and data analysis described in step 5 and step 6 of the manual. Instead, the collected examples can be used to demonstrate the existence and nature of marketing to children.

- **Expanded monitoring** is designed to answer the question: *How widespread is the problem?* Monitoring could include several communications channels and extending the monitoring period to collect a larger sample size. Ideally, include an evaluation of the healthfulness of the products marketed to children. For instance, use the traffic light system developed by the FSA in the UK. (See step 3 for more guidance on how to define ‘healthy’ and ‘unhealthy’ food).

- **Advanced monitoring** is designed to answer the questions: *Exactly how big is the problem? Can we show changes and trends over time?* Monitoring could be spread over different periods during the year. Use a nutrient-profiling model to assess the products marketed to children (see step 3). If relevant, it could also give special attention to different sub-groups within the population.
An illustrative example of the three levels is provided in Table 1.

Table 1: Illustrative example of monitoring levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Expanded</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Collect a small sample of marketing of foods and non-alcoholic beverages to children from across different marketing channels to illustrate the nature of the problem.</td>
<td>In addition to the core level: • Systematically monitor at least one other main marketing communications channel (eg radio, print publications).</td>
<td>In addition to the core and expanded levels: • Monitor over multiple periods during a year.¹¹ • Give special attention to the potential differing exposure of marketing communications between different socio-economic and ethnic backgrounds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>AND/OR</td>
<td>AND/OR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Do a more systematic study but limit it to just one main marketing communications channel in the country (eg television, online, in schools, outdoor).</td>
<td>• Use a model, such as the FSA traffic light system, to evaluate the healthfulness of the products marketed to children.</td>
<td>• Use a nutrient-profiling model to evaluate the healthfulness of the products found to be marketed to children at the core and expanded levels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOR EITHER</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Use food-group categorisation to assess healthfulness of the products.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To decide the scope of the research, carefully assess resources (such as the staff, budget, equipment and time) available, and then set objectives. If resources are constrained, it is worth keeping in mind the various elements of the research design that add to the time and cost, such as:

- Monitoring several marketing channels requires more time for data-collection, and also accumulates more data to analyse.
- Monitoring that requires fieldwork is more time-intensive, and incurs extra expenses such as travel (for example monitoring outdoor advertising, food packaging and marketing in schools).
- More comprehensive studies of the ‘measured media’ (see definition in Box 3) often use audience measurement data from secondary sources to inform the sample selection. Such data, if it is available, can be expensive to purchase.
- Carrying out nutrient-profiling analysis of the food products marketed to children can be complex and time-consuming (see step 3).

The following schematic shows the different steps of the research process. In the subsequent sections, the manual will give guidance on each step in turn.
The research process

1. Determine the scope of the research (core, expanded or advanced) based on an assessment of resources and capacity

2. Decide what marketing communications channels to monitor

3. Set the key definitions

4. Sample specification and planning

5. Data collection and data coding

6. Analysis

7. Reporting and dissemination

- Identify existing research and information
- Definition of ‘children’
- Definition of ‘marketing targeted at children’
- Definition of ‘unhealthy foods’
- Food-group categorisation
- Dietary guidelines
- Nutrient profiling
- Adapt coding form
### Table 2: Examples of key data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of data</th>
<th>Where to source data</th>
<th>How data could inform what to monitor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food companies’ marketing expenditure broken down by communications channels and target audience age groups.</td>
<td>A) Company-produced data on its own marketing expenditure (often not made publicly available).&lt;br&gt;B) Data collected by commercial market research, media or advertising agencies. Examples include AC Nielsen, Zenith Optimedia, WARC and Ad Age ($)*.</td>
<td>Provides information on the largest communications channels targeting children by expenditure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case studies on food-industry trends and marketing expenditure.</td>
<td>A) News stories, industry reports and case studies published in relevant trade press and marketing publications.&lt;br&gt;B) Examples collected and published by civil society organisations, academic studies etc.</td>
<td>Provides an idea on where marketing efforts are being concentrated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articles on how companies target children.</td>
<td>A) Data collected and published by market researchers, government, local authorities, civil society organisations, NGOs and academic institutions.&lt;br&gt;B) Private companies or research agencies on behalf of private and public sector clients may carry out market research with children, and publish the results.</td>
<td>Provides information on the media communications that are most popular with children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology penetration in households, eg television, satellite, digital TV, radio, internet, mobile phones and other new media.</td>
<td>Data collected and published by market researchers, government, local authorities, civil society organisations, NGOs and academic institutions.</td>
<td>Provides information on the media with high household penetration and media with low penetration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children’s media habits, eg the time children spend on different media and technologies, communication preferences, brand perception etc.</td>
<td>A) Data collected and published by market researchers, government, local authorities, civil society organisations, NGOs and academic institutions.&lt;br&gt;B) Children’s media habits are likely to differ between different socio-economic groups within a country when, for example, there is differing access to communications channels.</td>
<td>Provides information on where research has already been done, and so what monitoring is needed to complement or build on existing knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existing research on food marketing to children via different marketing channels.</td>
<td>Data collected and published by market researchers, government, local authorities, civil society organisations, NGOs and academic institutions.</td>
<td>Provides information on where research has already been done, and so what monitoring is needed to complement or build on existing knowledge.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*($) denotes it is likely there will be a cost to purchase the dataset.
Set the key definitions

When planning the monitoring, some important key definitions have to be determined. It is crucial to be clear about these definitions as they will determine what to monitor and what is to be analysed. The important definitions and factors to consider, in addition to deciding which communications channels to monitor, include:

What is the definition of ‘children’?
There is no one globally agreed definition for the age of a ‘child’. Children can be defined as any age up to the age of 18. Some countries have specified their own definition of a child, either generally, or in policies specific to children, or specific to marketing communications. In accordance with the CI/IOTF International Code on Marketing of Foods and Non-Alcoholic Beverages, this manual recommends children are defined as “people under the age set by member state legislation and in any case not less than 16 years old”.

How to define marketing targeted at children
Marketing communications should be considered to be targeting children if any of the following factors indicate that children are the intended audience or the likely recipient of the marketing communications:

The context and setting in which the marketing communications appear
Does the marketing appear in association with a channel, event, setting or activity with which children are likely to be the direct or indirect audience such as on television, in magazines, on internet websites, at a sporting event or in public settings such as playgrounds, nurseries and schools?

Viewing/listening audience (broadcast media)
Are children considered to be the primary audience or are children in the audience in significant numbers? When defining the viewing/listening audience, both the absolute number of children likely to be watching or listening, and the number of children as a proportion of the overall audience should be taken into account. Audience measurement data, if it is available, can give such detail.

Scheduling and placement (broadcast media)
Does the advertisement appear at a time or in a place where children are likely to be in the audience, such as programmes scheduled particularly for children or during programmes popular with children (but not made specifically for them)? Children are potential receivers of marketing at any time of the day that they are likely to be in the audience, such as between the hours of 6am and 9pm.

The nature of the food product
Whether any food product promoted is designed for children, likely to appeal to children, usually promoted to children, or typically consumed by children.

The creative and visual techniques used
The marketing communications can be defined as targeted at children if, for example, one or two of the following marketing techniques for targeting children are deemed to be ‘prominent’:

- The overall presentation, features, content, language and colours likely to appeal to children, including the use of:
  - bold graphics and animation
  - images or pictures of animals, toys, balloons, cars, boats or aeroplanes etc
  - bright colours
  - music or songs likely to appeal to children
  - language intended for children, or spoken by or directly to children.

- Children are represented.

- The use of people, personalities, celebrities, their associates, or other persons or individuals whose name or image may be familiar to or of appeal to children.

- The use of cartoon characters including brand-owned and licensed.

- The inclusion of free gifts (eg downloads or merchandise), toys or collectible items with appeal to children.

- The inclusion of competitions, vouchers, games with appeal to children.

- The design or novelty value of the food product or food packaging (eg ‘fun-shaped’ foods).

- Sponsorship of materials, products, people, events, projects, cultural, artistic or sporting activities or places popular with children, or with a significant child audience.
Core Food-group categorisation and evaluation

Products that are marketed to children are sorted into food groups and food categories (or sub-groups). Appendix A includes a food-group categorisation system, which can be adapted to each country, and template coding forms for recording the information are also available. An evaluation of the healthfulness of the products can then be made using a common understanding of whether products in specific food groups or categories can be said to contribute to a healthful diet, and to make some conclusions as to the nature and healthfulness of the typical food products directed at children. For instance, previous research has shown that certain foods are commonly found to be high in fat, saturated fat, salt or sugar, and that these tend to be particularly heavily promoted to children. These include snack foods, soft drinks (sugar-sweetened), breakfast cereals (sugar-sweetened), confectionary and fast food.

Such an evaluation will include a degree of subjectivity, and is not based on any specified cut-off points for ‘high’ or ‘unhealthy’.

Expanded

The UK FSA traffic-light system

This model was designed for the UK Food Standards Agency’s (FSA) proposed front-of-pack labelling scheme. This model is easy to use and provides a relatively simple and suitable method for determining the healthfulness of a product. The traffic light colour approach specifies criteria that define the green (low), the amber (medium) and the red (high) boundaries for the key nutrients fat, saturated fat, sugars and salt. Products that fall into the high or red category for any of the key nutrients can be defined as ‘unhealthy’.

The criteria that define the colour code for a food or drink product are set out in Appendix B.

Advanced

Nutrient profiling

Several nutrient-profiling (NP) models have been developed for the purpose of monitoring marketing of foods to children and to define whether a product is healthy or unhealthy. The advantage of using a NP model is that it can be used in relation to food products available in any given country, and in relation to a wide range of foods. For the purposes of this manual, and if no national model exists, it is recommended using a nutrient-profiling model developed by the FSA.

The UK FSA NP model uses a ‘simple scoring’ system, where points are allocated on the basis of the nutritional content in per 100g of a food or drink. Values are attached to the different constituents of a food or drink, with points given for total energy, saturated fat, salt and total sugar, which are offset by points given for protein and dietary fibre (all per 100g) and fruit/vegetables/nuts (%). These seven constituents provide a single score for a given food. If that score is below a certain threshold, the food is classified as ‘healthy’. A detailed guide on how to use this model can be found at http://collections.europarchive.org/tna/20100927130941/http://food.gov.uk/healthiereating/advertisingtochildren/nutlab/nutprofmod

### Table 3: How to define unhealthy foods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Expanded</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Food-group categorisation and evaluation</strong></td>
<td><strong>The UK FSA traffic-light system</strong></td>
<td><strong>Nutrient profiling</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Products that are marketed to children are sorted into food groups and food categories (or sub-groups). Appendix A includes a food-group categorisation system, which can be adapted to each country, and template coding forms for recording the information are also available.</td>
<td>This model was designed for the UK Food Standards Agency’s (FSA) proposed front-of-pack labelling scheme. This model is easy to use and provides a relatively simple and suitable method for determining the healthfulness of a product. The traffic light colour approach specifies criteria that define the green (low), the amber (medium) and the red (high) boundaries for the key nutrients fat, saturated fat, sugars and salt. Products that fall into the high or red category for any of the key nutrients can be defined as ‘unhealthy’. The criteria that define the colour code for a food or drink product are set out in Appendix B.</td>
<td>Several nutrient-profiling (NP) models have been developed for the purpose of monitoring marketing of foods to children and to define whether a product is healthy or unhealthy. The advantage of using a NP model is that it can be used in relation to food products available in any given country, and in relation to a wide range of foods. For the purposes of this manual, and if no national model exists, it is recommended using a nutrient-profiling model developed by the FSA. The UK FSA NP model uses a ‘simple scoring’ system, where points are allocated on the basis of the nutritional content in per 100g of a food or drink. Values are attached to the different constituents of a food or drink, with points given for total energy, saturated fat, salt and total sugar, which are offset by points given for protein and dietary fibre (all per 100g) and fruit/vegetables/nuts (%). These seven constituents provide a single score for a given food. If that score is below a certain threshold, the food is classified as ‘healthy’. A detailed guide on how to use this model can be found at <a href="http://collections.europarchive.org/tna/20100927130941/http://food.gov.uk/healthiereating/advertisingtochildren/nutlab/nutprofmod">http://collections.europarchive.org/tna/20100927130941/http://food.gov.uk/healthiereating/advertisingtochildren/nutlab/nutprofmod</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**How to define ‘unhealthy’ foods**

The WHO Recommendations specify that the aim should be to reduce the impact on children of “foods high in saturated fats, trans-fatty acids, free sugars, or salt”, but do not specify the cut-off points for the definition of ‘high’ or ‘healthy’. In order to determine the healthfulness of a product marketed to children, a definition of what is meant by ‘unhealthy’ should be established. This manual recommends three options for core, expanded and advanced monitoring:
**Things to keep in mind**

• A product’s nutritional information is needed in order to evaluate the products using both the FSA traffic light system and the FSA NP model. This information may be found on the nutrition information panel of the product packaging. Alternatively, it may be obtained from the manufacturer's website or by contacting the manufacturer directly.

• The nutritional information used for analysis should be retained as evidence in case the results are disputed.

• Some companies give the nutritional content in grams and some per serving. There are also differing definitions of what a serving is. The information supplied by the manufacturer may need to be converted in order to carry out the nutrient-profile analysis.

• Depending on level of monitoring and the available resources, choose either:
  
  – **Comprehensive analysis**: All food and beverage products found during monitoring (data collection) are subjected to nutrient-profiling analysis.

  – **Partial analysis**: A selection of products is chosen for further analysis if there are resource constraints, and a lot of data has been collected. Make the selection in a systematic way so the selection is unbiased. An example includes selecting only every fourth product for further nutrient-profile analysis; 25% of featured foods in the sample would then be subjected to further analysis.
Sample specification

Once the key definitions have been identified, the next step is to decide on the timing and length of monitoring. Table 4 gives illustrative examples of key definitions, and setting the sample specifications for monitoring TV advertisements, magazine advertisements and product packaging.

### Table 4: Illustrated example of sample specification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marketing communications channel</th>
<th>Television</th>
<th>Magazines</th>
<th>Product Packaging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Age of child</td>
<td>Children under 16</td>
<td>7-11 year olds, 12-16 year olds</td>
<td>Children under 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Marketing communications channel</td>
<td>Largest national commercial channel and largest pay-TV channel</td>
<td>Publication(s) with the largest weekly circulation for each age group</td>
<td>Four supermarket chains</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Marketing directed at children (eg according to scheduling, audience, timing, placement, content)</td>
<td>Food and beverage advertisements shown between 6am and 9pm</td>
<td>Food and beverage advertisements in children’s magazines</td>
<td>Marketing techniques to children used on cereal product packaging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Defining ‘unhealthy’ foods</td>
<td>A nutrient-profiling model</td>
<td>Food-group categorisation</td>
<td>FSA traffic light system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Monitoring frequency and length (data collection)</td>
<td>Every day for two weeks</td>
<td>Eight issues per title targeting each age group</td>
<td>Visit one branch of each chain in a specified city area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Monitoring dates</td>
<td>Specified hours, days-of-week and dates, eg 6am-9pm Monday (date) to Sunday (date)</td>
<td>Two periods across the seasons, eg four weeks in February and four weeks in May</td>
<td>Each branch visited in a specified period, eg between 1 and 21 March</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Things to keep in mind

- When setting the dates for the monitoring, be aware of seasonal and weekly variations in the frequency of different marketing campaigns. Depending on whether the marketing strategy is short, medium or long-term, a campaign may run intensively in a given period of time, and then there is very little activity after that. Alternatively, brands or products may use regular but infrequent promotions. Consider spreading monitoring over two separate periods of time to reduce the likelihood of the monitoring being affected by short-term marketing campaigns. Also avoid scheduling any monitoring on or in the days leading up to any seasonal or religious events as this can have a temporal impact on the marketing techniques used (eg a lot of special promotions).
- It needs to be decided whether sampling should take into account any specific subgroups. A population usually consists of a range of socio-economic and population subgroups, based on identifiers such as ethnicity, language, cultural traditions geographic region or urban neighbourhood. Socio-economic class, for example, could be important for different children’s access to certain types of media (eg the internet), and ethnicity could have some direct or indirect impact on children’s sensitivity to different marketing techniques (eg the use of celebrities or music).
**Data collection and data coding**

**What is data collection?**

Once all the decisions have been made regarding the research design and planning, the data collection and data coding can begin. Data collection refers to the process of gathering evidence such as recording TV advertising, scanning the internet or visiting the local school to gather evidence of the exposure and power of food marketing to children.

**Things to keep in mind**

- Always save an image of any marketing communications. Depending on what channel is monitored, this could be a still photo from a video recording, a photograph of magazine advertising, screen-grabs from the internet, photographs of on-street advertising or in-school marketing and so on. Images can then be stored, filed and returned to for further coding and analysis. Images can also be used to illustrate the techniques used to target children, and as evidence in reports or presentations. Ensure images are of good quality and clearly capture the detail of the marketing example.

- If the monitoring involves field visits, agreement from the relevant persons may be required. In some cases, such as a visit to a school, prior agreement is definitely required. However, in other cases, such as a visit to a supermarket, the individual researcher must decide according to the nature and context of the research.

- Ensure all files, tapes and images are saved to a computer, and clearly labelled with the date, time and place of the monitoring, and any other relevant information.

**What is data coding?**

The collected data will need to be ordered into a set of predefined variables. It usually involves a coding form which contains all the core variables to be coded. Some of these variables include a number of possible sub-categories (or codes). A template coding form specific to monitoring the marketing channels in part 2 of this manual, television, print, food companies’ websites, outdoor advertising, food packaging and in-school marketing, can be downloaded from the CI website at http://bit.ly/codingform. The core variables and corresponding sub-categories to be collected are outlined in Table 6. The core variables and sub-categories can be adapted, and additional variables can be added if necessary.

Coding is especially useful if a lot of data has been collected. It will also make the statistical analysis outlined in step 6 easier to do as, once the coding has been done, the data can more easily be manipulated for analysis. If the research has accumulated only a small sample, systematic data coding and data analysis may not be necessary. However, it is still important to have some kind of system for categorising the collected data.

**Things to keep in mind**

- Depending on what marketing channel is monitored, data collection and coding may take place independently of each other or simultaneously. For example, for TV, the data collection is the recording of advertisements as they appear during the monitoring period. The data coding then takes place at a later time when the researcher watches the recordings. For outdoor advertising, the streets are scanned for evidence of marketing communications, and the coding can start in situ. If necessary, photographs can be used for further coding later on.

- Data collection and coding can be laborious but it is important to be systematic and pay attention to detail. Using a coding form will help.

- Ensure all staff have been trained and know how to use any relevant coding forms.
**Instructions for data coding using the template coding form**

Select the appropriate coding form for the marketing channel monitored. Adapt the coding form if necessary, and include any extra variables if additional information is gathered.

At the top of each sheet enter the following information:

### Table 5: Coding form key information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data source</th>
<th>Where the data was collected from (eg TV channel, store name)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Date of data collection/monitoring</td>
<td>The date the data was collected (dd/mm/yy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time of data collection/monitoring</td>
<td>The time the data was collected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of coding</td>
<td>The date of the data entry/coding (dd/mm/yy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name or ID of coder</td>
<td>The name or ID of the person doing the data coding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Enter the core variables

A horizontal row in the coding form should be used for each example of marketing communications eg a TV advertisement, a poster advertisement, a product’s packaging. Work from left to right, and enter the relevant information under each core variable heading (column).

Some of the core variables include a number of predefined subcategories or codes, set out in Table 6 below. The words **in bold** are the short codes as they appear in the coding form.

The template coding form includes instructions on what and how to code.

Additional variables, which are specific to each marketing communications channel, are contained in the relevant coding form.

### Table 6: Coding form core variables and codes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core variables</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Unique ID</strong></td>
<td>Ex: CH1/01, then CH1/02 and so on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Brand name</strong></td>
<td>As per promotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Product name</strong></td>
<td>As per promotion OR • Brand only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Company (if different from Brand name)</strong></td>
<td>As per promotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Product category (optional)</strong></td>
<td>Choose ONE • <strong>Food or non-alcoholic beverage</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• <strong>Other</strong> (if the promotion is for a non-food or non-drink product, no further coding is required)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Food group</strong></td>
<td>Refer to Appendix A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Food category</strong></td>
<td>Refer to Appendix A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6: Coding form variables and codes (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core variable</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marketing technique</strong></td>
<td>Code as many as applies (insert additional columns in coding form as required)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Words IN BOLD as they appear on the coding form)</td>
<td>• The overall presentation, features, language and colours likely to appeal to children including the use of:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– bold graphics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– animation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– images/pictures eg animals, toys, balloons, cars, boats or aeroplanes etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– bright colours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– music/songs likely to appeal to children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– language intended for children, or spoken by or directly to children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Children represented</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The use of celebrity/personalities with appeal to children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The use of cartoon character (brand-owned)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The use of cartoon character (licensed)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Inclusion of free [choose from list]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– gift (eg downloads, branded merchandise)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– toy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– collectible item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Inclusion of + [choose from list]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– competition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– vouchers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– games</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Design or novelty of FOOD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Design or novelty of PACKAGING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Sponsorship of + [chose from list] popular with children, or with a significant child audience:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– cultural, artistic or sporting activities or places</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marketing technique description</strong></td>
<td>Free text option to include detailed description of marketing technique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FSA nutrient profile</strong> (optional)</td>
<td>Choose ONE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Healthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Unhealthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FSA traffic lights (optional)</strong>*</td>
<td>Choose ONE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugars</td>
<td>• High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fat</td>
<td>• Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saturates</td>
<td>• Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salt</td>
<td>** Other information** Free text option to include any other relevant information</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Sometimes food manufacturers and fast-food companies advertise brands, logos or characters associated with unhealthy products to children without actually featuring products in the advertising. For example, there are examples of McDonald’s advertisements that promote the McDonald’s brand and restaurants, without specifically advertising its products. In such instances, it is recommended that ‘Brand only’ is coded under the variable ‘Product name’.

** The coding form includes the option to code the results of either the FSA traffic lights model or the FSA NP model. For the latter, the score for the product should be determined by following the instructions for that particular model,[27], and the results subsequently entered into the coding form.

*** See Appendix B for the criteria that define the low, medium and high boundaries for food and drink.
## Data analysis

The manual is designed to help researchers answer some specific questions on the exposure and nature of food marketing to children for each marketing communications channel monitored. The coding form has been designed with this in mind. If the variables set out in step 5 have been collected, it should be possible to carry out some of the basic analysis suggested in Table 7 below. The statistical outcomes can be complemented by descriptions and photographic evidence.

### Table 7: Suggested basic analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What we want to know</th>
<th>What you need to calculate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How much food marketing is directed to children?</td>
<td>1. In the coding form under the variable ‘Product category’, count and add up the entries coded ‘Food and non-alcoholic beverage’ plus ‘Other’ (we call this number A).&lt;br&gt;AND&lt;br&gt;2. In the coding form under the variable ‘Product category’, sort and count the entries coded ‘Food and non-alcoholic beverage’ (we call this number B).&lt;br&gt;To get your answer (Y), use the percentage calculation: B / A x 100 = Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What type of food products are advertised to children?</td>
<td>1. B - as above&lt;br&gt;AND&lt;br&gt;2. In the coding form under the variable ‘Food group’, sort and count the entries for EACH group in turn (we call this, number C).&lt;br&gt;3. Under the variable ‘Food category’, sort and count the entries for EACH category in turn (we call this number D)&lt;br&gt;To get your answer (Y) use the percentage calculation: Food groups C / B x 100 = Y&lt;br&gt;Food categories D / B x 100 = Y (replace the number D to get the result for each food category)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What marketing techniques are used to target children?</td>
<td>1. B - as above&lt;br&gt;AND&lt;br&gt;2. In the coding form under the variable(s) ‘Technique’, sort, count and add up the entries for each technique in turn (we call this number E).&lt;br&gt;To get your answer (Y), use the percentage calculation: E / B x 100 = Y (replace the number E to get the result for each technique)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Things to keep in mind

To do statistical calculations a relatively large sample size is needed. For example, a large study of TV advertising accumulates much more data than a small study on outdoor advertising. If your sample size is very small, just calculate the frequencies. To illustrate: ‘of the [x] number of adverts found during monitoring, [x number] were for food and non-alcoholic beverages. Of these, [x number] were for fast food and [x number] were for confectionary’.

In addition to the basic analysis, consideration should be given to more in-depth analysis if permitted by the data.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 7: Suggested basic analysis (continued)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>What we want to know</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the volume of healthy and unhealthy food marketing directed at children? (UK FSA traffic light model)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the volume of healthy and unhealthy food marketing directed at children? (UK FSA NP model)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Research on monitoring food marketing to children can be reported in a number of formats.

The format selected should be designed with the intended audience in mind as well as resource constraints. The different potential formats are as follows:

- press release
- newspaper or magazine article
- scientific journal article
- pamphlet or leaflet
- conference or seminar presentation
- website pages
- report for submission to official institutions
- reports for circulation within and among consumer organisations.

If the research is a large-scale project that will be used to underpin policy development, it needs to be presented with all the evidence in full, accompanied by the policy and regulatory arguments. If the results are to be used for campaigning and advocacy, the research should (also) be published in a much shorter and user-friendly form for that purpose. If the report is written in a national language, consider translating the report or writing a brief summary in a language that ensures it can be read amongst an international audience.

Some general guidance on what to include when writing up the results is listed below. The level of detail and the visual presentation should be adapted depending on the format of the report:

- Give background: the context and why the research was carried out, previous research and any gaps in knowledge identified.
- Outline the research aims and objectives.
- Outline research design and research methods.
- Explain how the sample specifications were selected and why.
- Outline main findings organised in appropriate chapters with subheadings.
- Include graphics, charts and tables to support your discussion.
- Include images and photographs for illustration.
- Write a final section outlining all the conclusions and any recommendations that have arisen from the research.
- Include relevant literature and links.
- Put the larger data tables and lists in an Appendix.

Presentation and content are equally important as format, and should, likewise, be designed with the intended audience in mind. Reviewing existing reports and presentations on monitoring food marketing to children can generate useful ideas for the presentation of results. See Appendix D for a reading list of monitoring studies.
Disseminating the results

A lot of effort goes into the research, and it is important that the results reach the intended audience and the people you want to influence. It is therefore important to invest some time in the dissemination of the research findings:

- Develop a list of national and international people and organisations to contact, including government, academic institutions, civil-society organisations, international NGOs etc. Organisations to consider include:
  - national and international consumer groups
  - medical and health groups, including paediatric organisations and nutritionists
  - groups working with children, including teachers’ groups, nursery schools, children’s rights groups
  - food companies highlighted in your research (consider including both national and international headquarters).
- Also use websites, blogs and social networks such as Twitter and Facebook to highlight the research.
- Send a copy of the report to everyone on your list with a cover letter clearly explaining the findings of the research. Follow up with a phone call to ensure they have received it and read it.
Food marketing is directed at children via a wide range of marketing communications channels, and most campaigns are integrated across a variety of broadcast and non-broadcast channels.
Specific considerations for monitoring food marketing to children

Television

Why monitor television?
In many countries, TV advertising is typically one of the largest marketing communications channels. There is strong evidence that advertising on TV has a significant impact on children’s food preferences and purchase requests.28

Monitoring approach
Record advertising during TV programming.

Which channels?
Selection will depend on the availability of different commercial channels. Focus on the largest free-to-air commercial channel/s or the channels with the largest child audiences. If there is a high penetration of pay-TV channels, consider which of these needs to be included.

Which programmes?
There are different approaches to making this selection depending on whether the monitoring focus is ‘children’s programmes’ or ‘programmes watched by children’:

Children’s programmes
Programmes targeted primarily at children, such as programmes broadcast on dedicated children’s channels and programmes broadcast on other channels during defined children’s viewing times (for example Saturday and Sunday mornings, weekday mornings and afternoons).

Programmes watched by children
These are programmes that do not fall within the definition of ‘children’s programmes’, but which are likely to be watched by a child audience. They can be differentiated in various ways:
- All programmes broadcast during the day and before a set watershed after which few children are likely to be in the audience, such as 9pm or 10pm.
- Audience composition data ($)29 can be used to define programmes with ‘a significant proportion’ of children in the audience, for example when children make up 25% or 30% or more of the audience.
- Audience composition data ($) can be used to define programmes that include ‘significant absolute numbers’ of children in the audience (such as family films, game-shows, entertainment programmes, popular series or soaps).

Data collection
Set the timer on the recorder to the specified times, and use the coding form to code the advertisements that are shown during the monitoring period.
Print media

Why monitor print media?
Numerous print publications are targeted primarily or exclusively at children and adolescents. Many of these publications rely on advertising for their main revenue, and food advertising is therefore likely to be found in such publications.

Monitoring approach
Collect food advertising from print publications targeting children.

Which publications?
Choose the titles to monitor depending on the target age group (younger children or adolescents or both). Publications to monitor include cartoons, magazines, comic books or any other print publication aimed at children in the specified age group/s.

Focus on the best-selling titles for each age group. Readership profile and circulation figures ($) for publications aimed at children can be used to determine the publications to monitor. If such data is unavailable, consider asking a range of newsagent owners about the best-selling titles.

Decide how many editions of each title/publication will be included for monitoring. Keep in mind whether the publication is weekly, monthly or quarterly.

Data collection
Scan each publication for advertisements, and use the coding form to code the advertisements that are featured.
Food companies’ websites

Why monitor websites?
Internet access is growing worldwide, and, as a result, the internet is growing as a marketing medium. Many of the top food and beverage advertisers have branded websites designed to appeal to children. A 2006 study from the US found that 85% of the heaviest TV advertisers to children also had child-directed interactive websites, and nearly all of them contained branded images promoting specific products. Children’s exposure to marketing communications online is often interactive and prolonged, thereby increasing brand immersion and exposure.

Monitoring approach
Assess the content and techniques used to engage children on food and beverage companies’ own websites.

Which websites?
There are different approaches to selecting the websites to monitor depending on the availability of certain types of national secondary data. Table 8 sets out sample selection using secondary data on children’s internet use. Table 9 sets out sample selection using secondary data on advertising expenditure.

If secondary data is not available, a more random selection can be made. Identify popular food and beverage products or brands in one or several specific food groups (eg confectionary) or food categories (eg chocolate and sweets) that are well-known in your country, and which can be said to target children. Criteria for inclusion could include assessing the marketing techniques on the packaging or products which are advertised in a context where children are likely to be exposed.
Table 8: Sample selection using data on children’s internet use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data</th>
<th>Where to source data</th>
<th>How data could inform what to monitor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Brand- or product-specific websites with the highest number of child visitors (measured). | A) Internet traffic figures collected by specialist companies, such as comScore, Alexa, Hitwise, Nielsen Media Research, NetRatings and emarketer ($)*.  
B) Companies specialising in internet audience measurement panels ($)*. | Provides information on websites with the highest number of child visitors |
| Brand- or product-specific websites popular among children (unmeasured). | Data collected and published by market research companies, NGOs and academics on the most popular food brand websites accessed by children. | Provides information on websites that are popular among children |

*($) denotes it is likely there will be a cost to purchase the dataset.

If using this approach, now go to data collection below.

Table 9: Sample selection using advertising expenditure data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of data</th>
<th>Where to source data</th>
<th>How data could inform what to monitor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Food and beverage companies marketing expenditure targeted at children. | A) Company-produced data on its own marketing expenditure (often not made publicly available) ($)*.  
B) Data collected by commercial market research, media or advertising agencies. Examples include AC Nielsen, Zenith Optimedia, WARC and Ad Age ($)*. | Provides information on the largest communications channels targeting children by expenditure.  
If data is not available by age-groups, overall spend may be useful |
| Brands or products with the largest TV advertising expenditure.    | A) As A and B above  
B) Data collected and published by civil society organisations and academics on food brands advertised to children on TV. | In some markets, advertising during children’s programming has typically been the primary medium used to reach children, and can be used to identify top brands or products targeting children.31 |
| Data on the largest global marketers32 in the food and drink category. | Data collected by commercial market research, media or advertising agencies. Examples include AC Nielsen, Zenith Optimedia, WARC and Ad Age ($)*. | The largest global marketers operate in many different countries around the world. Be aware that, although these marketers are top spenders globally, they may not have introduced all or any of their products or brands in all countries. Only monitor brands that are known in country. |

*($) denotes it is likely there will be a cost to purchase the dataset.

Step 1: Identify the relevant brands or products to monitor
If using secondary data on advertising expenditure, identify the food brands or products that most heavily target children based on their expenditure.

Step 2: Identify the relevant website
Once the relevant brands or products have been identified, the main website for each product or brand needs to be identified. Type the name of the product or brand into a search engine such as www.google.com, www.yahoo.com, www.altavista.com, www.lycos.com. If available, use the local version of the search engine by changing .com to, for example, .co.uk.

If there is no product website, visit the brand website or the company website. The global website for the product, brand or company often contains links to local websites. If there is no local language website, consider whether to exclude the company. Otherwise, the default website, eg the US or global website, can be included if it is believed to be relevant, ie if children are likely to look at the global/US website.
Which method for website monitoring?

The website needs to be systematically scanned to assess the techniques and type of content within the site that can be said to be targeting children.

A website can contain hundreds of pages of information and links to microsites (which will contain a different URL address and open in a new window). The home page, the pages that proceed from the home page and the type of microsites linked to the original website could all be included for monitoring. It should be decided from the outset which parts of the website to include for further analysis:

- A comprehensive approach is to include pages containing the same stem URL. For example, `happymeal.com` is the website of interest, and `happymeal.com/#play` is an example of a page contained within the site.
- A simpler method is to use the ‘one-click approach’. This includes only navigating to pages that can be reached by one click on the mouse from the home page. To cover more pages, increase the number of clicks to two or three etc, always proceeding from the home page.
- Pages irrelevant to marketing can be excluded from further analysis. This includes pages such as corporate content, store locators, search functions, pages about the company or founder, food allergy and sensitivity information, privacy policies, terms of use and official rules.
- Unless it is a specific objective of the research, exclude any third party sites from further analysis.

Data collection

Assess the content of each website using the shortlist in step 5 and the coding form.

Additional marketing techniques to look out for on internet websites include:

(Words in bold as they appear on the coding form)

- **member clubs** that require registration or submitting of personal details*
- links to branded pages on **social networks**, such as brand fan-pages on Facebook or Bebo
- **advergames** (games with integrated marketing**)
- **viral marketing** (eg links to ‘share content with a friend’ or email greeting cards children are encouraged to personalise and send to friends)

*In some cases, you need to be a member or have a login address to view specific areas of the website. Registration sometimes asks for a child’s birth-date with some sites only allowing access for children over the age of, for example, 12 or 14. Others accept younger children or have no such check in place, which means children of all ages are invited to access the content. To access these areas, it may be necessary to set up identities as children of different ages.

**Advergames are online computer games that contain advertising integrated into the game, for example as an in-game billboard, as an advertisement when a game loads. The marketing can also be highly integrated, so for example there is a requirement to earn points by collecting the product in the game, or there is a requirement to ‘purchase’ the product, eg to get vouchers to complete higher levels of the game.
Outdoor advertising

Why monitor outdoor advertising?
Outdoor advertising on billboards and posters is one of the traditional forms of marketing. Brands often use advertisements strategically placed in areas of dense population and close to venues, such as schools etc, where children pass.

Monitoring approach
Monitor outdoor food and beverage advertisements in environments where children are commonly found, and assess the content of such promotions.

Which location?
Advertising can appear in many locations where children gather or frequently pass including the surrounding area of schools, nurseries, playgrounds, youth clubs, sports centres, cinemas and other entertainment venues or a main shopping street.

When choosing the location, consider the need to take into account different population sub-groups, for example socio-economic area profiles, population density and ethnicity. Relevant socio-economic data may be available from the national statistical office, governmental agencies or local authorities.

Data collection
The streets surrounding the start location (eg a school) are systematically scanned for billboards and posters carrying advertising.

Include all the billboards and posters with advertisements. Street signs and store names should not be included.

Record the details of each advertisement in the coding form, and take a photograph of each advertisement to use for documentation. Photographs can also be used to refine the details in the coding form later as it can be difficult and impractical to do all the coding whilst standing in the street.

Cover a uniform radius, for example a 500 metre radius from the chosen start location. Use maps to ensure that all of the surrounding area within the set radius is covered.
Food packaging

Why monitor food packaging?
Different techniques that are appealing to children are used on product packaging to attract children’s attention and to increase recognition of brands and products.

Monitoring approach
Assess the packaging of food products for use of techniques which are appealing to children.

Which stores?
The type and nature of shops in different countries vary hugely so the selection should be relevant to the country context. Examples include visiting a selection of different branches of supermarket chains, local stores, local food stalls selling manufactured food or a combination of these, to collect examples of product packaging.

Data on supermarket market share can be used to select the largest chains or a combination of larger and smaller store chains. If such data is unavailable, an alternative is to select the typical stores the majority of families with children shop in for their weekly groceries.

Also consider taking into account different population sub-groups and choose stores located in different socio-economic areas, and urban and rural locations. Relevant socio-economic data may be available from the national statistical office, governmental agencies or local authorities.

Which products?
Use the food categorisation system in Appendix A to select which food category to monitor.

There can be many available products in each category and each store so choose an approach to monitoring, either core or expanded, depending on resources and scope of the research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Expanded</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One food category</td>
<td>Two or more food categories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Code ONLY products in the food category that use marketing techniques to appeal to children. OR • Code ALL products available in the food category whether or not they use marketing techniques to appeal to children. This approach will allow you to quantify the proportion (%) of products in the food category that use specific marketing techniques to target children on the packaging.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data collection
Start by identifying the specific aisle or location of the product category specified for monitoring.

Assess the packaging for each product against the list of marketing techniques in step 5 and record the details into the coding form. Resources allowing, it is strongly recommended that the products are purchased to allow a detailed analysis of the packaging. It will be difficult and impractical to code each product whilst in the shop. If traffic light system analysis or nutrient profiling of the product is planned, purchasing the products is essential.

Take photographs from every angle of the products featuring marketing techniques to target children. Photographs can be used to refine the details in the coding document later, as it can be difficult and impractical to do everything whilst in store, and for documentation.
In-school marketing

Why monitor in-school marketing?
The WHO Recommendations explicitly state that places where children gather, including schools, should be free from food marketing. A wide range of differing strategies are known to be used in the school environment. This includes direct marketing (eg poster advertisements), indirect marketing (eg sponsorship of school materials) and product sales (eg vending machines), although the extent of commercial activity in schools is likely to vary from country to country and from school to school. (A more extensive list of forms of commercial activity in schools is included in Appendix C). Knowledge of how marketing occurs in school settings is important because of the potential implied approval that such settings can give to the marketing message; for example, a school setting implies that the school authority endorses the message.

Monitoring approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Expanded</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Field visits</strong> to schools, which include observation to collect examples of direct marketing and product sales in schools.</td>
<td><strong>Semi-structured interviews</strong> with school staff to collect examples of different types of direct and indirect marketing that would not otherwise be obvious to an outsider.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Core and expanded monitoring can be combined if resources allow it. Both approaches require 'recruiting' schools to take part.

Which schools?
Invite a number of schools to take part. Choose primary and secondary schools or a mix.

When making this selection, consider the need to take into account different population sub-groups as well as socio-economic area profiles and population density. Eg schools may be monitored in both urban and rural locations or in both affluent and economically deprived areas.

Recruitment may take several weeks or even longer to organise depending on the size of the research project. Some general steps to follow include:

• Decide the number of schools to monitor, and identify which schools to contact. Consider having a reserve list in case recruitment proves difficult.

• Contact the school and explain what the research is about, why the school has been identified to take part, and what level of participation is needed from the school.

• Ask for permission to visit, and, if possible, make all necessary arrangements for the actual field visits.

• If possible, also arrange for a brief interview with a number of staff (for expanded monitoring only).
Core monitoring: Field visits
Refer to the list of marketing examples typically found in schools in Appendix C, and try to find out one by one whether that technique is employed in the school by food marketers. There may be other examples not listed, and there will, of course, be variations from country to country, from school to school and from one time to another.

Explore all the areas of the school buildings, including classrooms, canteen, hallways, gymnasium, sports ground, school-bus stops etc, and note any examples of marketing using the coding form. Take a photograph of each example of marketing.

Expanded monitoring: Semi-structured interviews with school staff
Direct advertising and product sales will be more easily spotted during a field visit, but indirect marketing, such as advertising in education materials, sponsorship of events and so on, may not be obvious to an outsider. Interviewing a number of staff (or pupils) from the school can be used to complement directly-observed marketing:

• Probe respondents on their awareness of different types of marketing in their school (use the list in Appendix C), and ask if they have seen or experienced each type).

• If, for example, a company is sponsoring school events or equipment, try to find out as much detail about the nature and involvement of the company in the school.

• Whenever possible, ask to see examples of marketing in the school (for example education materials, equipment and so on), and take pictures which can be used as documentation and to give examples.

Data analysis
Use the coding form to categorise the examples of marketing found during field visits and mentioned in the interviews (if applicable).

If all the different examples of marketing that were found are coded, you will have a record for each school, and you can start making some comparisons and also evaluate which types of marketing are more or less prevalent and the nature of such marketing.
## Appendix A

### Australian food-categorisation system

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Food Group</th>
<th>Food Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beverages</strong></td>
<td>Fruit and vegetable juices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Soft drinks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Energy drinks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cordials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Electrolyte drinks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tea and coffee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Waters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bread and bakery products</strong></td>
<td>Bread</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Biscuits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cakes, muffins and pastries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cereal and cereal products</strong></td>
<td>Cereal bars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Noodles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Breakfast cereals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pasta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Couscous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unprocessed cereals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Confectionery</strong></td>
<td>Chocolate and sweets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jelly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chewing gum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Convenience foods</strong></td>
<td>Pre-prepared salads and sandwiches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pizza</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Soup</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ready meals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dairy</strong></td>
<td>Cheese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yoghurt and yoghurt drinks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Milk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cream</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Desserts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ice cream</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fast food and takeaway</strong></td>
<td>Asian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beverages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Breakfast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Burgers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chicken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dessert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fish and fish products</strong></td>
<td>Fresh fish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Processed fish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fruit and vegetables</strong></td>
<td>Vegetables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fruit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Herbs and spices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jam and marmalades</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nuts and seeds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Meat and meat products</strong></td>
<td>Fresh meat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Processed meat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sauces and spreads</strong></td>
<td>Sauces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spreads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Snack foods</strong></td>
<td>Crisps and snacks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other</strong></td>
<td>All other foods</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Boy in Trolley, by Ernst Vikne*
Appendix B

The UK FSA traffic light system

Products that fall into the ‘high’ or red category for any of the key nutrients, sugar, fat, saturates or salt, can be defined as ‘unhealthy’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guide to nutrient levels in food (per 100 g)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sugars</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5g and below</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fat</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3g and below</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Saturates</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5g and below</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Salt</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.3g and below</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guide to nutrient levels in drinks (per 100ml)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sugars</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5g and below</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fat</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5g and below</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Saturates</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.75g and below</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Salt</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.3g and below</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Salt or sodium may be given on nutrition information panels. Sodium is about 40% of salt, and can be converted as follows:

“High salt” is above 1.5g salt = 0.6g sodium (=600mg sodium).
“Low salt” is below 0.3g salt = 0.12g sodium (=120mg sodium).

*The FSA has also issued an updated version of the technical guidance with revised criteria for sugar to take into account both naturally occurring and added sugars. However, most products’ nutrition information panels only give ‘total sugars’. For ease of use, the manual refers to the criteria set for total sugars. See Food Standards Agency (2007) Using traffic lights to make healthier choices. Available at http://www.food.gov.uk/multimedia/pdfs/publication/foodtrafficlight1107.pdf

## Appendix C

### Commercial activities in schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Promotion type</th>
<th>Promotion category</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Product sales</strong></td>
<td>Product sales</td>
<td>Product sales in schools, e.g., in canteens, kiosks and vending machines. (There may be contracts or other arrangements between schools and food and drink companies to sell specific brands or products.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cash or credit-rebate programmes</td>
<td>Programmes that award cash or equipment to schools in proportion to the value of store receipts or coupons collected by them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Direct marketing</strong></td>
<td>Marketing in schools</td>
<td>Billboards and signs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vending machine front and side panels brand displays.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product displays.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Corporate logos or brand names on school equipment.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advertisements in school publications</td>
<td>Advertisements in school publications, e.g., school newspaper.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Media-based advertising</td>
<td>Televised ads aired by TV stations seen in schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ads in commercial newspapers or magazines.</td>
<td>Free samples of food products.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Indirect advertising</strong></td>
<td>Corporate-sponsored educational materials</td>
<td>Advertisements, corporate logos or brand names and product placements in education materials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education materials on issues associated with particular industries that are developed by those industries.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Corporate-sponsored teacher training</td>
<td>Training by companies on general subjects, such as management techniques or creativity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sponsorship of sports days and other events.</td>
<td>Corporate gifts to schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Market research</strong></td>
<td>Surveys or polls</td>
<td>Student questionnaires or taste tests, internet polls or tracking of students’ internet behaviour.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other</strong></td>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix D

Key reading


TV


Print


Online


Outdoor


Packaging


Schools


Multiple channels


Studies using nutrient profiling


See also Yale Rudd Center 2010

Non-English language studies


References

1 “Food” refers to food and non-alcoholic beverages.
5 World Health Organization (2010)
6 Unless otherwise stated, all figures from De Onis M et al (2010)
7 Figures from http://www.iaso.org/iot/obesity/obesitytheglobalepidemic
8 Ad Age Global Marketers 2009 http://adage.com/globalmarketers09#301
10 Global Intelligence Report, eMarketer and Starcom MediaVest, September 2010
11 Ad Age Global Marketers 2009 http://adage.com/globalmarketers09#301

12 Definition from World Health Organization (2010) Set of recommendations on the marketing of foods and non-alcoholic beverages to children.
13 Ensure the same methodology is used for data collection each period to enable accurate monitoring of change.
14 For an example see Federal Trade Commission (2008), Rudd Center for Food Policy and Obesity (2010)
15 For an example see Hawkes C (2002)
16 A child is defined as a person below the age of 18 in article 1 of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC).
17 Consumers International and the International Obesity Taskforce (2008)
18 Consumers International and the International Obesity Taskforce (2008)
19 Note the use of ‘or’ (rather than ‘and’) in the description of the food composition. For marketing to be restricted, the high content in one of the nutrients is sufficient to justify marketing restrictions: there is no need for the food to be high in more than one.
20 A food-group categorisation system developed by the George Institute in Australia is available in Appendix A, and is used as a reference in this manual. A different food group categorisation system can be used as necessary.
23 WHO has developed a manual to assist member states in developing or adapting existing models or developing their own NP models. See WHO Guiding Principles and Framework Manual for the development or Adaptation of Nutrient Profiling Models. 1st edition. World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland, 2011.
25 The model has been validated against other models and reviewed after two years’ operational use, and it was assessed as suitable and ‘fit for purpose’. Food Standards Agency Press Release, 2008. FSA’s Nutrient Profiling Model: ‘scientifically robust and fit for purpose’. Monday 7 July 2008 (ref: 2008/0726). Available at: http://www.food.gov.uk/news/pressreleases/2008/jul/nutrientprofiling
26 Alternative models include:
29 ($) denotes there is likely to be a cost to obtain the data.
30 Kaiser Family Foundation (2006)
31 This methodology was used by Kaiser Family Foundation (2006).
32 Some of the companies included will be the parent company for a number of brands which are heavily targeting children (eg Yum! Brands is the parent company of KFC, Taco Bell and Pizza Hut).
33 Some knowledge that marketing is in fact happening in schools is required before any fieldwork is organised. Visiting a school where there is no marketing is not the point. Field visits to schools can be the first step, followed up by interviews if there is evidence of involvement by food companies in the schools.